## STATE OF MICHIGAN

## BEFORE THE MICHIGAN PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION

\* \* \* \* \*

)

)

)

)

)

In the matter, on the Commission's own motion, directing **MARTELL CABLE SERVICES, INC.**, to show cause why it should not be found to be in violation of the Uniform Video Services Local Franchise Act, 2006 PA 480, MCL 484.3301 *et seq.* 

Case No. U-20504

At the July 2, 2019 meeting of the Michigan Public Service Commission in Lansing,

Michigan.

PRESENT: Hon. Sally A. Talberg, Chairman Hon. Norman J. Saari, Commissioner Hon. Daniel C. Scripps, Commissioner

### **ORDER GRANTING MOTION TO AMEND SHOW CAUSE ORDER**

On April 18, 2019, the Commission issued an order in this docket (April 18 order) stating that

the Commission Staff (Staff) had determined that Martell Cable Services, Inc. (Martell Cable) may

be in violation of the Uniform Video Services Local Franchise Act, 2006 PA 480 (Act 480), MCL

484.3301 et seq.

Specifically, the Staff reported that Martell Cable had failed to provide information to the

Commission required under MCL 484.3309 (Section 9).

MCL 484.3309(1)-(4) provides as follows:

(1) A video service provider shall not deny access to service to any group of potential residential subscribers because of the race or income of the residents in the local area in which the group resides.

(2) It is a defense to an alleged violation of subsection (1) if the provider has met either of the following conditions:

(a) Within 3 years of the date it began providing video service under this act, at least 25% of households with access to the provider's video service are low-income households.

(b) Within 5 years of the date it began providing video service under this act and from that point forward, at least 30% of the households with access to the provider's video service are low-income households.

(3) If a video service provider is using telecommunication facilities to provide video services and has more than 1,000,000 telecommunication access lines in this state, the provider shall provide access to its video service to a number of households equal to at least 25% of the households in the provider's telecommunication service area in the state within 3 years of the date it began providing video service under this act and to a number not less than 50% of these households within 6 years. A video service provider is not required to meet the 50% requirement in this subsection until 2 years after at least 30% of the households with access to the provider's video service subscribe to the service for 6 consecutive months.

(4) Each provider shall file an annual report with the franchising entity and the commission regarding the progress that has been made toward compliance with subsections (2) and (3).

Thus, subsection (4) of Section 9 requires submission of an annual report to the Commission

containing specific information required under subsections (2) and (3). On October 1, 2018, the

Staff notified Martell Cable via regular mail and email that the Section 9 annual report was due

October 19, 2018. On October 15 and 18, 2018, the Staff sent the company reminder emails to file

the report. On October 22, 2018, the Staff sent a Past Due Notice via regular mail and email. On

October 30, 2018, the Staff sent a Final Notice letter via certified mail with a due date of

November 6, 2018. On December 3, 2018, the Final Notice letter was returned to the Commission as unclaimed.

In addition to the above annual report, video cable providers are required to submit to

the Commission an annual survey pursuant to MCL 484.3312 (Section 12), which

provides, in pertinent part:

(2) A video service provider shall submit to the commission any information requested by the commission necessary for the preparation of the annual report required under this subsection.

On November 30, 2018, in accordance with Section 12 requirements, the Staff sent Martell Cable the 2018 Video/Cable Provider survey letter via certified mail and email with a due date of December 14, 2018. On December 10, 2018, the Staff sent the company a reminder via email. On December 17, 2018, the Staff sent a Past Due Notice via email. On December 19, 2018, the Staff sent a Final Notice letter regarding the survey via certified mail and email. On January 2, 2019, the Video/Cable Provider survey letter was returned to the Commission as unclaimed by Martell Cable. On January 18, 2019, the Final Notice letter was returned to the Commission as unclaimed by Martell Cable.

In addition, on June 28, 2018, in Case No. U-20093 (June 28 order), the Commission ordered Martell Cable to provide documentation prior to the company's annual Section 9 filing that the company had updated its status as a legally operating corporation with the Corporations, Securities & Commercial Licensing Bureau of the Department of Licensing and Regulatory Affairs (LARA).

As of April 18, 2019, the Commission had not received either the Video Cable Provider Survey, the Section 9 report, or the required documentation relating to the company's status as a legally operating corporation with LARA. In response, on April 18, 2019, the Commission issued the April 18 order directing Martell Cable to show cause why the company should not be found in violation of the above-described sections of Act 480 and the June 28 order. Martell Cable was ordered to file a response in this docket by 5:00 p.m. on May 14, 2019. Martell Cable's response was to be accompanied by prefiled direct testimony, exhibits, work papers, and affidavits supporting the veracity of its response prepared by a person or persons with actual knowledge of the circumstances. Martell Cable was also ordered to appear with counsel at a prehearing conference scheduled for 9:00 a.m. on May 21, 2019, before Administrative Law Judge Kandra K. Robbins (ALJ) at the Commission's offices, 7109 W. Saginaw Highway, Lansing, Michigan, 48917. Interested parties were to file a petition for leave to intervene by May 14, 2019. All further proceedings in this matter were to be scheduled by the ALJ.

On May 21, 2019, a prehearing conference was held before the ALJ. Mr. Anthony Martell appeared at the proceeding *in pro per* despite having been informed that he could not represent Martell Cable corporation because he is not an attorney; however, the Staff stated that Mr. Martell may be operating Martell Cable as a sole proprietorship under the name "Martell Cable Service" or "Martell Cable Services," rather than as a corporation.<sup>1</sup> The Staff requested an adjournment to provide Mr. Martell with additional time to provide documentation to clarify his company's operating status. The ALJ granted the adjournment and rescheduled the prehearing conference for June 5, 2019, acknowledging that "[t]he parties have an understanding between themselves as to what documents are necessary to be presented for a resolution in this matter." 1 Tr 5.

On June 3 and 4, 2019, Mr. Martell filed a status report and affidavit for Martell Cable Service. It is not clear whether the report and survey were filed on behalf of the corporation or the sole proprietorship. Neither is it clear the date on which Martell Cable, the corporation, became Martell Cable Service, the sole proprietorship.

On June 5, 2019, a second prehearing conference was held before the ALJ at which Mr. Martell again appeared *in pro per*. At this proceeding, he asserted that he is the sole proprietor of Martell Cable Service. The ALJ did not permit Mr. Martell to proceed because the case is

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> On May 20, 2019, Mr. Martell filed a document in this docket indicating that on May 20, 2019, he filed a notarized certificate with Oakland County, Michigan, stating that he now owned or intended to own, conduct, and transact business under the name of "Martell Cable Service." *See*, certificate of persons conducting business under assumed name, Case No. U-20504 filing #U-20504-0008.

captioned to the corporation, Martell Cable Services, Inc. A contested proceeding was scheduled for September 4, 2019. 2 Tr 8-15.

On June 12, 2019, the Staff filed a motion to amend the April 18 order to add language to compel Mr. Martell, d/b/a Martell Cable Service, to provide the documentation required by the April 18 order and to require Mr. Martell to timely provide all documentation that may be requested by the Staff.

The Commission finds that the motion should be granted, and that Anthony Martell, d/b/a Martell Cable Service, shall timely provide all documentation as requested by the Staff.

#### THEREFORE, IT IS ORDERED that:

A. The caption of Case No. U-20504 is amended to include Anthony Martell, d/b/a Martell Cable Service, and shall read: In the matter, on the Commission's own motion, directing Martell Cable Services, Inc., and Anthony Martell, d/b/a Martell Cable Service, to show cause why it and/or he should not be found to be in violation of the Uniform Video Services Local Franchise Act, 2006 PA 480, MCL 484.3301 *et seq*.

B. Anthony Martell, d/b/a Martell Cable Service, shall file his response to the allegations set forth in this order to show cause accompanied by supporting documentation in this docket by 5:00 p.m. (Eastern time) on July 17, 2019.

C. Petitions for leave to intervene in the matter shall be filed by July 17, 2019.

D. Anthony Martell, d/b/a Martell Cable Service, shall appear at a contested proceeding scheduled for 9:00 a.m. (Eastern time) on September 4, 2019, before Administrative Law Judge Kandra K. Robbins at the Commission's offices, 7109 W. Saginaw Highway, Lansing, Michigan, 48917.

The Commission reserves jurisdiction and may issue further orders as necessary.

Any party desiring to appeal this order must do so by the filing of a claim of appeal in the Michigan Court of Appeals within 30 days of the issuance of this order, pursuant to MCL 484.3314(4) and MCL 484.2203(12). To comply with the Michigan Rules of Court's requirement to notify the Commission of an appeal, appellants shall send required notices to both the Commission's Executive Secretary and to the Commission's Legal Counsel. Electronic notifications should be sent to the Executive Secretary at <u>mpscedockets@michigan.gov</u> and to the Michigan Department of the Attorney General - Public Service Division at <u>pungp1@michigan.gov</u>. In lieu of electronic submissions, paper copies of such notifications may be sent to the Executive Secretary and the Attorney General - Public Service Division at 7109 W. Saginaw Hwy., Lansing, MI 48917.

## MICHIGAN PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION

Sally A. Talberg, Chairman

Norman J. Saari, Commissioner

Daniel C. Scripps, Commissioner

By its action of July 2, 2019.

Barbara S. Kunkel, Acting Executive Secretary

# PROOF OF SERVICE

STATE OF MICHIGAN )

Case No. U-20504

County of Ingham

)

Brianna Brown being duly sworn, deposes and says that on July 2, 2019 A.D. she

electronically notified the attached list of this Commission Order via e-mail transmission,

to the persons as shown on the attached service list (Listserv Distribution List).

Brianna Brow

Subscribed and sworn to before me this 2<sup>nd</sup> day of July 2019.

Angela P. Sanderson Notary Public, Shiawassee County, Michigan As acting in Eaton County My Commission Expires: May 21, 2024

Name	Email Address
Benjamin J. Holwerda	holwerdab@michigan.gov
Daniel Sonneveldt	sonneveldtd@michigan.gov
Kandra Robbins	robbinsk1@michigan.gov
Martell Cable Company	martellcable@comcast.net

charles.forst@360.NET carl.billek@CORP.IDT.NET dbronson@BLANCHARDTEL.COM clglover@ATT.COM rg1467@ATT.COM schoen.kevin@ACD.NET David.thomas@ALPHACOMM.NET cg5262@ATT.COM mb@BIRNS.NET ted.hankins@CENTURYLINK.COM scott.ringo@CINBELL.COM cchamp@CMCTELECOM.NET ddragan@CMCTELECOM.NET joel.brewer@ENVERSA.COM Regulatory.affairs@EXCEL.COM pbowman@GLCOM.NET strandtc@LIQUIDWEB.COM pwickstr@PACWEST.COM kscovill@TELECOMSYS.COM compliance@velocity.org dbailey@BULLSEYETELECOM.COM jsa@AMBT.NET toddg@CASAIR.NET ljfreeman@BANDWIDTH.COM tnamy@CLEARRATE.COM pjosephson@STERLINGBUSINESSLAW.COM stacey parker@CABLE.COMCAST.COM pmasters@ERNESTGROUP.COM jmorris@FIRSTCOMM.COM robert.e.stewart@FTR.COM clockett@INTRADO.COM smendez@MCGRAWCOM.NET mark@NOMADINTER.NET rdichy@METTEL.NET sfenker1@EARTHLINK.NET

Global Connection Inc. of America IDT America, Corp. Blanchard Telephone Association, Inc. AT&T Comm of MI, TCG Detroit Hold AT&T Michigan No Name Available Velocity David Bailey American Broadband & Telecom Crystal Auto Sys dba Casair Bandwidth.com CLEC, LLC Clear Rate Comm, Inc. **Trans National Comm Comcast Business Communications, LLC** Ernest Communications, Inc. First Communications, LCC **Frontier Communications** Intrado Communications, Inc. McGraw Communications, Inc. Media Gate Communications, Inc. Metropolitan Communications **Nexus Communications** 

jrenneker@NOS.COM sm1024@CYNERGYCOMM.NET JBrown@VCOMSOLUTIONS.COM akubs@800GOQUICK.COM byuille@800GOQUICK.COM info@RELIANT.NET Idellaero@TRINSIC.COM cfoster@CALLONE.NET pwstark@UP.NET refisher@MEI.NET teri@CARRINTER.NET chapintel@POWER-NET.NET jburnham@CTSTELECOM.COM lingle@CYTELCOM.COM ibrogan@JAMADOTS.NET byung@TELAVA.COM jcschaefer@KALTELNET.NET rfletcher@LENTEL.COM corie@OGDENTEL.COM ehe@AVCI.NET souders@SANDCREEKTELCO.COM Janet@SPRINGCOM.COM wfh@SPRINGCOM.COM kenneth.schifman@SPRINT.COM jcompton@BLUECASA.COM bboshoven@USSIGNALCOM.COM mark@WALDRONTEL.COM ron.siegel@ALLBAND.ORG pmorse@FAIRPOINT.COM sgibbs@NHCGRP.COM admin@RANGETELE.COM mvitale1@DNSYS.COM jcui@ONECOMMUNICATIONS.COM sb1015@CYNERGYCOMM.NET cir@DAYSTARR.NET tm5886@ATT.COM rick@RACC2000.COM dave@CASS.NET felicel@MICHIGAN.GOV vmg@ALPENAPOWER.COM

NOS Communications, Inc. Osirus Communications, Inc. Quantum Shift Communications **Quick Communications** Quick Communications, Inc. Reliant Communications, Inc. Trinsic Communications, Inc. United Comm, Inc. dba Call One Baraga Telephone Company Barry County Telephone Company Carr Telephone Company Chapin Telephone Company Climax Telephone Company Cypress Comm Oper Company, Hiawatha Telephone Company **IBFA Acquistion Company** Kaleva Telephone Company Lennon Telephone Company Ogden Telephone Company **Pigeon Telephone Company** Sand Creek Telephone Company Springport Telephone Company Springport Telephone Company Sprint Communications Company, L.P. **TNCI Operating Company, LLC** U.S. Signal Company, LLC Waldron Telephone Company **Allband Communications Cooperative** FairPoint Communications Solutions Corp. New Horizons Comm Corp. **Range Corporation TruComm Corporation** Jie Cui CynergyComm.Net, Inc. DayStarr, LLC Bell South Long Dist Inc., dba AT&T **RACC Enterprises, LLC Deerfield Farmers** Lisa Felice Vicki Goodburne

chopkins@GRID4.COM regulatory@BULLSEYETELECOM.COM regulatory@INTRADO.COM gcglodek@TOUCHTONE.NET Gregg.diamond@VERIZON.COM regulatory@primustel.ca jkreucher@HOWARDANDHOWARD.COM krichel@DLIB.INFO deborah.kuhn@VERIZON.COM joe.topel@ORANGE-FTGROUP.COM tjackson@BIRCH.COM Andrew.Labbe@LEVEL3.COM linda.cicco@BT.COM brett.ferenchak@BINGHAM.COM steve@LUCRE.NET regulatory@PIONEERTELEPHONE.COM robert.mccausland@H3NET.COM djc@METRONET.CC aeconomou@METTEL.NET truskowski@ACECOMGROUP.COM cfl.regulatory@CHARTERCOM.COM shamula@WVFIBERNET.NET sbohler@CZN.COM jkk@LECMI.COM pearcec@MICHIGAN.GOV jon brinton@MITEL.COM matt-schultz@COMCAST.NET Marva.Johnson@MYBRIGHTHOUSE.COM sbogdan@BROADVIEWNET.COM dgonos@FLASH.NET Sandra.blade@WINDSTREAM.COM toddg@ISERVGROUP.COM rmillar@NEXTGNETWORKS.NET rsullivan@YGNITION.COM

Grid4 Communications Inc. Bulls Eye Telecom Inc. Intrado Communications Inc. TouchTone Communications Inc. Verizon North Inc. PTGi Intl Carrier Services, Inc. Kreucher, Jon D. **Thomas Krichel** Deborah Kuhn, Verizon France Telecom Corporate Solutions L.L.C. Birch Telecom of the Great Lakes, Inc. Level3 Comm **BT** Communications Sales LLC **Bingham McCutchen LLP** Lucre, Inc. Telecom Management, Inc., dba Pioneer Long **Robert McCausland** MetroNet-Telecom, Inc Metropolitan Telecomm of MI Ace Telephone Company of Michigan, Inc. Charter Fiberlink- Michigan, LLC **Fibernet of Michigan** Frontier Communications of Michigan Local Exchange Carriers of Michigan, Inc. Chrissie Pearce- MPSC **MiTel NetSolutions** ATI Network,s Inc Bright House Network Broadview Networks & A.R.C. Networks, GVC Networks, LLC Intellifiber Networks, Inc. **JAS Networks & EagleNet** NextG Networks Ygnition Networks, Inc.

swarren@tminc.com markj@ACCESSONEINC.COM marv.bulev@ONVOY.COM jason.brown@ACCESSPOINTINC.COM LegalNotices@ACNINC.COM marva.johnson@BHNIS.COM bstewart@EASTONTELECOM.COM cbarton@WCS.COM john.ivanuska@XO.COM cmartin@WIDEOPENWEST.COM gloria.t.silas@VERIZON.COM mark@CSILONGWOOD.COM sales@CREXENDO.COM jkorn@STORESONLINE.COM vanessa.leon@SPECTROTEL.COM Steve@CASAIR.NET jet@T2COMM.NET joe@TC3TELECOM.COM gregl@GOAIT.COM cschneider@CMCTELECOM.NET psc@IBCTELECOM.COM regulatory@MATRIXBT.COM jean.paul@TDSTELECOM.COM butler@EOT.NET isaacs@ISG-TELECOM.COM dstoll@MEI.NET ranthony@JAMADOTS.COM fxm@QTELEPHONE.COM askus@BUCKEYE-TELESYSTEM.COM BRex@BUCKEYE-TELESYSTEM.COM sharonl@ACCUTEL.NET regulatory@TNCII.COM david.vehslage@VERIZON.COM dprather@INDIGITAL.NET james.mackenzie@QUORTECHEQUITIES.COM WiMacTel, Inc. chris@CASTLEWIRE.COM kelly.faul@XO.COM mark.iannuzzi@TELNETWW.COM legal.request@elnk.com

**Technologies Management** Access One, Inc. Onvoy, Inc. Access Point, Inc. ACN Comm Services, Inc. **Bright House Networks Information Services** Easton Telecom Services, L.L.C. Wholesale Carrier Services, Inc. **XO** Communications Services, Inc. Sigecom, LLC dba WOW! Interent, Cable and P Gloria Silas, Verizon Compliance Solutions, Inc. **Crexendo Business Solutions** Crexendo Bus Solutions. Spectrotel, Inc. **Crystal Automation Systems T2** Communications TC3 Telecom Inc. Advanced Intergrated Technologies, Inc. CMC Telecom, Inc. **IBC** Telecom Matrix Telecom, Inc. & Trinsic Communicatio TDS Telecom, Inc. Empire One Telecommunications, Inc. **Voxbeam Telecommunications Barry County Telephone** Chippewa County Telephone Quality Telephone, Inc. Buckeye Telesystem, Inc. **Buckeye Telesystem** Accutel of Texas, L.P.; Phone Co, L.P. tncii.com (No Name Available) MCIMetro Access Transmission **Communications Venture** Castle Wire, Inc., f/k/a Business Communica Nextlink Wireless, Inc. Telnet Worldwide, Inc., Superior Spectrum T No Name Available